

CR15-00707-PHX-SRB

LORENZO VIDINO

3-9-16

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT

FOR THE DISTRICT OF ARIZONA

United States of America,)
)
Plaintiff,)
)
vs.) CR15-00707-PHX-SRB
) Phoenix, Arizona
) March 9, 2016
Abdul Malik Abdul Kareem,)
)
Defendant.)
)
)
)

BEFORE: THE HONORABLE SUSAN R. BOLTON, JUDGE
EXCERPT OF REPORTER'S TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS
TESTIMONY: LORENZO VIDINO
JURY TRIAL - DAY #9

APPEARANCES:

For the Government:

U.S. ATTORNEY'S OFFICE
By: Kristen Brook, Esq.
Joseph Edward Koehler, Esq.
40 North Central Avenue, Suite 1200
Phoenix, AZ 85004

For the Defendant Abdul Malik Abdul Kareem:

MAYNARD CRONIN ERICKSON CURRAN & REITER PLC
By: Daniel D. Maynard, Esq.
Mary Kathleen Plomin, Esq.
3200 North Central Avenue, Suite 1800
Phoenix, AZ 85012

Official Court Reporter:

Elizabeth A. Lemke, RDR, CRR, CPE
Sandra Day O'Connor U.S. Courthouse, Suite 312
401 West Washington Street, SPC 34
Phoenix, Arizona 85003-2150
(602) 322-7247

Proceedings Reported by Stenographic Court Reporter
Transcript Prepared by Computer-Aided Transcription

CR15-00707-PHX-SRB

LORENZO VIDINO

3-9-16

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

INDEX OF WITNESSES**LORENZO VIDINO:**

Direct examination by Ms. Brook	Page 3
Cross examination by Mr. Maynard	Page 27
Redirect examination by Ms. Brook`	Page 37

INDEX OF EXHIBITS

<u>EXHIBIT NO.:</u>	<u>DESCRIPTION:</u>	<u>RECEIVED:</u>
Exhibit No. 616	CV - Lorenzo Vidino	Page 6

CR15-00707-PHX-SRB

LORENZO VIDINO

3-9-16

E X C E R P T O F P R O C E E D I N G S

MS. BROOK: Thank you, Your Honor.

The Government calls Dr. Lorenzo Vidino.

THE CLERK: Please state your name for the record,
spelling your first and last name.

THE WITNESS: Sure. Lorenzo. That's L-O-R-E-N-Z-O
V-I-D-I-N-O.

THE COURT: You may proceed, Ms. Brook.

MS. BROOK: Thank you, Your Honor.

And, Maureen, when you have a moment, can you hand
him Exhibit 616, please.

LORENZO VIDINO, WITNESS, SWORN**DIRECT EXAMINATION**

BY MS. BROOK:

Q Good afternoon.

A Good afternoon.

Q Would you please introduce yourself to the jury.

A Sure. My name is Lorenzo Vidino.

Q And, Dr. Vidino, what do you do for a living?

A I work at George Washington University. I run a research
center at GW.

Q The research center that you run, what's the name of it?

A It's called the Program On Extremism.

Q So it's the Program On Extremism?

A Yes, correct.

CR15-00707-PHX-SRB

LORENZO VIDINO

3-9-16

1 Q And what is your specific field of expertise?

2 A Basically, for the last 15 years, I have studied what's
3 called jihadist homegrown networks in the West, Europe, and
4 North America.

5 Q Let's take a moment and talk about your educational
6 background. Where did you go to college?

7 A Well, I got my undergraduate degree in law in Italy. Then
8 I moved to the states in 2002 and I went to -- I got my
9 masters and Ph.D. from Tufts University.

10 Q And your masters and your Ph.D., one by one, what was your
11 focus in those studies?

12 A Sure. The masters was in international relations with a
13 focus on security; and the Ph.D. was also on international
14 relations with a focus on Middle East and security.

15 Q And you mentioned that you also studied law. Did you get
16 a law degree when you were in Italy?

17 A Yes.

18 Q The focus of your studies related to your Ph.D.,
19 specifically, what was it?

20 A I looked at homegrown networks, jihadist networks in the
21 West, the processes of radicalization and recruitment for --
22 at the time it was al-Qa'ida -- there was no ISIS -- al
23 Qa'ida-related networks in Europe and North America.

24 Q And when was it that you got your Ph.D.?

25 A What year?

CR15-00707-PHX-SRB

LORENZO VIDINO

3-9-16

1 Q Yes.

2 A 2010.

3 Q Have you published books on the subject of terrorism?

4 A Yes. I published -- I authored three books and I have
5 edited three books.

6 Q Specifically, let's go through them one by one.

7 What was the first book you published?

8 A The first one was call *Al-Qa'ida in Europe*, but it was
9 back in 2005 and I think it was the first book on the subject,
10 on *Al-Qa'ida in Europe* back then.

11 Then I published a book in 2010, *The New Muslim*
12 *Brotherhood In The West*. That was for Columbia University
13 Press.

14 And then I published another book on jihadist
15 networks in Italy back in 2013.

16 Q Do any of the books that you've published or work focus on
17 al-Qa'ida in Iraq or the Islamic State?

18 A Yeah. I have a chapter in the *Al-Qa'ida in Europe* book on
19 Europeans and North Americans going to Iraq to fight. It was
20 obviously the very beginning. It was 2005.

21 So the phenomenon of foreign fighter had just
22 started. And then I added to the book which came out two
23 years ago, 2014, if I'm not mistaken on -- it's called *ISIS*
24 *Incubators* and it's about recruiting networks for ISIS, again
25 in Europe and North America.

CR15-00707-PHX-SRB

LORENZO VIDINO

3-9-16

1 Q And the books that you've published, your educational
2 background, as well as the articles that you have written, are
3 they all contained within your CV?

4 A Yes.

5 Q And before you is Exhibit No. 616. I'm going to place it
6 on the overhead so you can see it before you.

7 Is that your CV?

8 A Yes. Correct.

9 MS. BROOK: So the Government would move to admit
10 616.

11 MR. MAYNARD: No objection.

12 THE COURT: I was hoping not, Mr. Maynard, after I
13 twisted Mr. Koehler's arm on the last one.

14 616 is admitted.

15 (Exhibit No. 616 admitted in evidence.)

16 BY MS. BROOK:

17 Q You spoke a moment ago about working at George Washington
18 and being the founder and director of the program on
19 extremism.

20 In relation to your work there, have you recently
21 published a report?

22 A Yes. On December 1st, 2015, we published a report which
23 is called *ISIS in America: From Retweets to Raqqa*.

24 And it's basically the first to report or published
25 on ISIS in America, on recruitment networks in America for

CR15-00707-PHX-SRB

LORENZO VIDINO

3-9-16

1 ISIS.

2 Q And that report itself, so it talks about recruitment
3 networks. Generally speaking, what does the report detail?

4 A Well, basically what we did, we did two things. We have a
5 research team at the center. We looked at all the cases of
6 individuals who are being charged with ISIS-related activities
7 in the U.S. since the first case which was March 2014. So we
8 looked at the 71 individuals who have been charged in the U.S.

9 We looked at all the legal documents. We looked
10 at -- we interviewed people, supplemented with thousands and
11 thousands of pages of records, with interviews, media
12 reporting.

13 And then what we also did is we looked at the online
14 scene. We looked at Twitter, Instagram, Facebook, a variety
15 of social media platforms where American-based ISIS
16 sympathizers interact.

17 Q And the report itself, once it was released back in -- you
18 said December?

19 A December 1st, yes.

20 Q Has it been relied upon or spoken about in mainstream
21 media?

22 MR. MAYNARD: Objection, Your Honor. This is not
23 rebuttal at this point.

24 THE COURT: We're still getting his qualifications, I
25 think.

CR15-00707-PHX-SRB LORENZO VIDINO

3-9-16

1 MR. MAYNARD: Okay.

2 THE COURT: Overruled. You may answer.

3 THE WITNESS: Yeah. I think it was well received, I
4 would say, both within government and, generally speaking,
5 policy-making circles. It was mentioned in three
6 Congressional hearings. I was asked to testify before the
7 Senate last January.

8 And it also received a lot of media coverage. It
9 was, incidentally, released the day before the San Bernadino
10 attacks. It was purely coincidence, obviously, and it
11 received a lot of media attention, so it was featured in New
12 York Times, Washington Post, Wall Street Journal, CNN. You
13 name it, all the mainstream media outlets covered it.

14 Q Does the report itself focus on homegrown violent
15 extremism?

16 A Yes. We looked at cases of Americans who join ISIS, all
17 the cases are Americans, people arrested in the U.S. and the
18 vast, vast majority of them are U.S. citizens.

19 Q What's the main take-away point from the report?

20 A I would say the main one is that there's no such thing as
21 a common profile of ISIS support or ISIS sympathizers in the
22 U.S.

23 It really runs the gamut. You have teenage girls and
24 40-year-old men. You have all kinds of socioeconomic
25 backgrounds, all kinds of educational backgrounds, different

CR15-00707-PHX-SRB

LORENZO VIDINO

3-9-16

1 patterns into radicalization, different recruiting patterns,
2 so absolute diversity in profiles.

3 Q And just a little bit more about your background before we
4 jump into the meat of the testimony here.

5 Have you written apeds?

6 A Yes. I write fairly often in both American and
7 international media.

8 Q Who for?

9 A Recently published in the Washington Post a couple of
10 times, Boston Globe, Wall Street Journal, and also a lot of
11 media in Europe, Middle East.

12 Q Have you appeared on television as an expert in the area
13 related to terrorism?

14 A Yes, but fairly often also I would say in the U.S. with
15 the big networks like CNN, MSNBC, Fox, CBS, NBC, ABC.

16 Q Are you quoted in newspapers as it relates to homegrown
17 extremism?

18 A Yes, again, fairly often. Particularly, of course, when
19 something related to terrorism comes up in the news, I am
20 called upon relatively often by, you know, again, sort of
21 mainstream media, the New York Times, Wall Street Journal.

22 Q And in connection with your work in this case, have you
23 been compensated or do you expect to be compensated?

24 A Yes.

25 Q And roughly what do you expect to be compensated in

CR15-00707-PHX-SRB

LORENZO VIDINO

3-9-16

1 connection with your work in this particular field?

2 A Sure. I'm being paid \$250 an hour.

3 Q And in total, how much do you think your bill will be for
4 for the amount of work you have done for this case?

5 A I would estimate about \$10,000.

6 Q Do you provide trainings and seminars on the Islamic
7 State?

8 A Yes, on the Islamic State and on radicalization in
9 general. We -- the center in general and myself personally --
10 we provide a lot of training, again, both in the United States
11 and abroad to law enforcement, intelligence agencies, as well
12 as, of course, you know, think-tanks, academia or
13 policymakers. We brief a lot. We provide a lot of -- we do a
14 lot of public speaking and seminars.

15 MS. BROOK: Your Honor, may I approach and turn this
16 board so it's facing forward?

17 THE COURT: Yes.

18 MS. BROOK: Thank you.

19 BY MS. BROOK:

20 Q And I'm turning around for the jury Exhibit No. 283 -- I'm
21 sorry -- 383 which has already been admitted and published.
22 It's our exhibit of photographs and names related in this
23 case.

24 Dr. Sageman was here today and were you in the
25 courtroom for that?

CR15-00707-PHX-SRB

LORENZO VIDINO

3-9-16

1 A Yes, I was.

2 Q Okay. He testified that there is no evidence that there
3 is a threat here in the United States from ISIS homegrown
4 extremists. Do you agree with that?

5 A No. I would strongly disagree with that.

6 Q Can you explain that?

7 A We have seen some 18 individuals arrested in the United
8 States for ISIS-related activities.

9 We have seen a few attacks that have been inspired by
10 ISIS.

11 The FBI speaks of around a thousand cases open
12 nationwide related to ISIS. And we have seen at least a dozen
13 Americans who have died in Iraq and Syria fighting with ISIS,
14 some of them are suicide bombers.

15 So I think we have a whole spectrum, whether it's
16 individuals who are just inspired by ISIS ideology or
17 individuals who have actually, physically joined ISIS and
18 pledge allegiance to ISIS. I think we have them in the United
19 States.

20 I would agree with what Dr. Sageman said that it's
21 less than in Europe, but I think every single official has
22 gone on the records in the U.S. saying that we have seen
23 ISIS-related radicalization in the U.S. and it's unprecedented
24 compared to what we used to see related to al-Qa'ida a few
25 years back.

CR15-00707-PHX-SRB

LORENZO VIDINO

3-9-16

1 Q And the radicalization itself, does that pertain to people
2 so "homegrown" -- how would you define that or how do you
3 classify that?

4 A The vast majority of individuals who are attracted to ISIS
5 ideology are individuals who are homegrown, U.S. born, whether
6 they are second or third generation immigrants or converts to
7 the faith.

8 The vast majority are people who are born and raised
9 in the U.S. or at least have gone -- and have undergone the
10 radicalization process in the United States; so homegrown,
11 yes.

12 Q I want to focus in for a moment on Shaykh Abdullah Azzam
13 who we have talked about in this case.

14 Dr. Sageman testified that categorizing him as the
15 Godfather of Jihad is ridiculous, that he is a Jordanian
16 scholar.

17 What is your opinion of Azzam as it relates to being
18 somebody that has an effect on violent jihadists?

19 MR. MAYNARD: Objection to the form of the question.

20 THE COURT: Sustained. You can rephrase your
21 question.

22 BY MS. BROOK:

23 Q Has Shaykh Azzam had a significant influence on violent
24 homegrown extremist jihadists?

25 A He's still referred to as one of the key idealogues of --

CR15-00707-PHX-SRB

LORENZO VIDINO

3-9-16

1 let's call it the "Jihadist Movement" even though he died a
2 long time ago.

3 His ideas are still very much referenced by a lot of
4 homegrown radicals in the U.S.

5 The idea that jihad is an individual obligation,
6 that's really the main contribution of Abdullah Azzam to the
7 jihadist movement is that it's mandatory upon every Muslim to
8 go and use violence to defend fellow Muslims who are under
9 attack.

10 That's where you get the Azzam contribution and
11 that's very much used by groups like al-Qa'ida, like ISIS, and
12 by individuals who seek to join groups like ISIS or al-Qa'ida.

13 So even though he was killed a long time ago, his
14 ideas are very, very much relevant today.

15 Q So starting in the 1980s, how did Azzam start to identify
16 himself?

17 A Azzam basically was the first charismatic individual that
18 understood that Afghanistan, when Afghanistan had been invaded
19 by the Soviets, was a cause not just for the Afghans but for
20 the whole Muslim Community, that all Muslims should have gone
21 to Afghanistan and defeated the Soviets.

22 Basically, he started to make it a religious
23 obligation. He crafted the idea. He was somebody with a
24 religious background. He was a cleric, indeed. And he made
25 the religious argument that it was religiously mandatory for

CR15-00707-PHX-SRB

LORENZO VIDINO

3-9-16

1 all able-bodied Muslims to go to Afghanistan and fight.

2 His ideas have been used by people after him to make
3 every other conflict that involves Muslims is a mandatory
4 jihad.

5 Q So in present day do ISIL members see Azzam as somebody
6 that is inspirational in terms of violent jihad?

7 A Yes, absolutely. And it's clear from the fact that you
8 see it online, on social media where, in conversations among
9 ISIS sympathizers, a lot of them use the icon of Abdullah
10 Azzam as their icon on Twitter or on Facebook.

11 They share books. They share links. They share
12 lectures. Abdullah Azzam is one of the, I would say, top five
13 idealogues of the global movement.

14 Q And, historically, who was Azzam a mentor for?

15 A Osama bin Laden.

16 Q Was he a mentor in person with him or was it just his
17 writings?

18 A No. No. Absolutely, they knew each other very well. And
19 the very beginning of the experience of Arab volunteers going
20 to Afghanistan to fight the Soviets was the office that
21 Abdullah Azzam and Osama bin Laden created in Peshawar
22 together in the mid '80s. Abdullah Azzam and Osama bin Laden
23 started what's called a services office in Peshawar, Pakistan,
24 in the mid '80s.

25 That was the first place created to have Arab

CR15-00707-PHX-SRB

LORENZO VIDINO

3-9-16

1 volunteers go and fight in Afghanistan against the Soviets.

2 Azzam was older, more charismatic, and more
3 knowledgeable than bin Laden. Bin Laden looked up to Azzam.
4 To simplify things a bit, bin Laden had the money, Azzam had
5 the brains.

6 Q Let's shift gears for a moment and talk about Anwar
7 al-Awlaki.

8 So Dr. Sageman testified that Anwar al-Awlaki's
9 historical lectures are pretty uncontroversial presently.

10 Do you agree with that?

11 A It depends what you mean by "controversial."

12 I would say they're not directly advocating violence.
13 It's clear that there is a trajectory in al-Awlaki's work
14 where he calls for direct attacks and for violence and does,
15 indeed, come to light only late by let's say 2005, 2006,
16 definitely after his incarceration in Yemen.

17 But his early works are really set -- sort of create
18 a narrative of confrontation with the West, a narrative of
19 victimization that is conducive to violence.

20 It's not purely religious work. It's not just purely
21 explaining the life of the Prophet.

22 One of the main reasons why al-Awlaki was -- and
23 still is -- so popular is because he contextualizes arguments
24 that come from Islamic history and Islamic writings from 14
25 centuries ago within a modern setting. So he talks about

CR15-00707-PHX-SRB

LORENZO VIDINO

3-9-16

1 Islamic civilization being under attack by the West.

2 There's parts of certain -- some of his writings
3 where he talks about McDonald's Civilization and part of that
4 imposition of the McDonald's Civilization on the Islamic word
5 is the fact that if you don't accept McDonald's, you're also
6 going to have bombs and the West is going to attack you.

7 Q So let me just take a second and rewind for a moment.

8 So in talking about, you know, the Hereafter or Life
9 and Times Of The Prophet, those particular types of lectures,
10 are they ones that present day homegrown extremists still find
11 inspirational and important to them?

12 A Yes, absolutely.

13 Q And in a nutshell, can you explain why?

14 A First of all, they are very sophisticated explanations of
15 parts of the faith which, you know, jihadists will look at the
16 violent part, but also they will look at the foundations of
17 Islam.

18 So al-Awlaki plays a role in explaining those parts
19 which are less controversial. But it's also the beginning,
20 the foundation, of a certain narrative whose logical
21 consequence is violence.

22 Q So I want to talk about mainstream society and the take or
23 the view of al-Awlaki over the last ten years. So we've
24 talked about in this case that Anwar al-Awlaki was killed by a
25 drone strike in 2000 -- or I'm sorry, in 2011.

CR15-00707-PHX-SRB

LORENZO VIDINO

3-9-16

1 MR. MAYNARD: Objection to the form of the question.

2 THE COURT: It's not clear where you're going. You
3 said ten years. I was just going to ask you to clarify.

4 Are you talking about in his last ten years or in the
5 period 2006 to 2016?

6 MS. BROOK: That's right. I'll ask a better
7 question.

8 THE COURT: We all know he died in 2011.

9 BY MS. BROOK:

10 Q So before 2011, was it reported in mainstream media that
11 Anwar al-Awlaki had violent jihadi views.

12 A I would say that by -- right after 9/11 and definitely
13 once the 9/11 Commission Report came out, you had reporting in
14 the media that he was linked -- some of the 9/11 hijackers,
15 and that he had questionable connections.

16 By 2007/2008, it was public knowledge that he had
17 become violent and associated with al-Qa'ida.

18 You have coverage in the Washington Post and Time
19 Magazine, on CNN, talking about this American cleric being one
20 of the main sources of inspiration of a lot of plots, a lot of
21 individuals that carried out attacks in the West. So but by
22 2008, I would say, it was very much public knowledge.

23 Q Have you read and are you familiar with the 9/11
24 Commission Report?

25 A Yes, I am.

CR15-00707-PHX-SRB

LORENZO VIDINO

3-9-16

1 Q And briefly, what is it?

2 A It's the official government analysis, basically, of what
3 happened on 9/11, what lead to the attacks, and basically,
4 then it also issued recommendations for how to prevent future
5 atrocities.

6 Q Approximately what year was it released in?

7 A 2004, I believe.

8 Q And does it talk about Anwar al-Awlaki?

9 A Yes.

10 Q Generally, what does it report?

11 A It basically questions the fact that -- talks about the
12 fact that al-Awlaki had been a mentor to some of the -- to two
13 of the core 9/11 hijackers.

14 And in particular, the fact that he was a mentor to
15 them in San Diego when they arrived in the United States for
16 the first time in 1999 in preparation for the attacks; and
17 then the fact that one year later, he's also mentoring them
18 when they moved to Virginia.

19 So that this long, protracted interaction with two of
20 the core 9/11 hijackers and a lot of other unanswered
21 questions about it, I think, at the time -- and that's the
22 time also when al-Awlaki came under investigation from the
23 FBI.

24 There were a lot of questions that were not really
25 answered. And it then lead to al-Awlaki himself realizing he

CR15-00707-PHX-SRB

LORENZO VIDINO

3-9-16

1 was monitored, leave the country.

2 Q By 2007, did Anwar al-Awlaki advocate for American Muslims
3 to integrate into American society or was he encouraging
4 something else?

5 A I think that's debatable whether he was encouraging them
6 to integrate. He was very critical of American society, of
7 Western society in general. He always advocated for an
8 Islamic society ruled by Sharia law.

9 He did not advocate violent confrontation with the
10 West, necessarily, but he argued that good Muslims lived only
11 under an Islamic order, so not a democratic order.

12 Q I want to take a moment.

13 Yesterday we heard testimony from Ms. Deedra Abbud
14 who is the former Executive Director of the Arizona Board for
15 CAIR -- or CAIR. And what does "CAIR" stand for?

16 A It's the Council on American Islamic Relations.

17 Q Can you give us a quick background sketch on what CAIR is?

18 A CAIR is a -- I would say a slightly controversial
19 organization because it is an advocacy group and does some
20 good work on civil liberties. But at the same time, it has
21 been under investigation from authorities for a long time.

22 It was in 2007/2008 an unindicted co-conspirator in
23 the largest terrorism financing case in U.S. history.

24 Q Let's talk for a second. Does CAIR have a Texas branch?

25 A Yes, we do.

CR15-00707-PHX-SRB

LORENZO VIDINO

3-9-16

1 Q And before May 3rd of 2015, did CAIR, the Texas branch,
2 speak about the Draw the Prophet Muhammad Art Exhibit that was
3 going to be held in Garland, Texas?

4 A Yes. They sent out a few bulletins, a few communiques
5 denouncing the event.

6 Q And when were those? Do you remember when they were
7 released?

8 A In the weeks leading to the event. I would say April --
9 in March/April.

10 Q Dr. Sageman testified about The Battle of Hearts and
11 Minds.

12 Placing on the overhead first what's already been
13 admitted as the string site from the Lenovo computer.

14 Based upon your research, your studies, your work, do
15 violent jihadis rely upon the Battle of Hearts and Minds as an
16 important work?

17 A It's a work that appears often in the library of
18 individuals who are engaged in violent activities.

19 Q And can you explain how parts of its message appeal to
20 those individuals?

21 A Well, not directly advocating violence. It still lays out
22 that the initial narrative of confrontation between the West
23 and Islam, that sort of incompatibility between the West and
24 Islam, but he argues exists.

25 And at the same time argues that basically those --

CR15-00707-PHX-SRB

LORENZO VIDINO

3-9-16

1 that those Muslims who do not live or aspire to live under
2 Sharia law are basically not good Muslims, which is quite a
3 confrontational message but could lead to violence. It
4 doesn't necessarily. It's not always leading to violence, but
5 it's sort of the beginning of the trajectory that leads to
6 violence.

7 Q I want to take a second and switch gears and speak for a
8 moment about terrorism cells.

9 So Dr. Sageman testified that terrorism cells, as it
10 relates to division of labor, that he has only seen one case
11 where there was a terrorism cell that had a division of labor
12 of the people within the cell.

13 Is that consistent with what you have seen?

14 A I would say no. There's obviously enormous diversity in
15 how terrorist cells work and networks work. I mean, you can
16 have a generalized answer.

17 I would say that in particular in structured groups,
18 it's normal to have a division of labor. But even in more
19 improvised, certainly the homegrown clusters, homegrown
20 networks, you do see that people that have certain skills will
21 do certain things.

22 So if one -- somebody is better with computers, that
23 person will be more in charge of all the IT aspects of the
24 cells or the network's activities.

25 Somebody will be more prone to finding weapons or

CR15-00707-PHX-SRB

LORENZO VIDINO

3-9-16

1 finding explosives. Somebody else will be more the money
2 person.

3 So generally, there is that normal division. I think
4 it's almost normal. You have it in any kind of aggregation of
5 individuals. You can have five friends, so somebody is better
6 at organizing things, somebody is better at getting money.

7 It's a normal division of labor. I think that it
8 happens fairly normally.

9 Q Dr. Sageman also testified that members of terrorism
10 cells, homegrown extremist terrorism cells, will feel
11 uncomfortable with their former friends, especially in the
12 weeks prior to an attack and they self-isolate.

13 Is that something that you have seen?

14 A I would say that it does happen in some cases, but in the
15 majority of cases that I can think of, it's actually the
16 opposite. But you would have people who don't really have a
17 major change or behavior in the weeks or days leading up to an
18 attack.

19 I think it's normal, actually, to see whenever we see
20 interviews with people who live around people who carry out
21 attacks to see how shocked and surprised they were because
22 that person didn't really have a change in behavior and they
23 looked like a very normal person.

24 First example that comes to mind is the Boston
25 Marathon bombers. You know, the younger brother, in

CR15-00707-PHX-SRB

LORENZO VIDINO

3-9-16

1 particular, the younger of the two Tsarnaev brothers who did
2 his homework, went to a party a couple days before the attack,
3 lived with his roommate, a normal life.

4 So, again, some cases you might have that change in
5 behavior, but in most cases I would say no.

6 Q So is that Johar Tsarnaev?

7 A Johar Tsarnaev, yes.

8 Q And you said he lived with his roommate. Was his roommate
9 Muslim?

10 A No.

11 Q And in the days before he was going to movies and doing
12 normal things?

13 A Yeah. He was going to class, going out with friends,
14 having dinner, you know.

15 Q Based upon your experience, are violent jihadis always
16 devout in there practice?

17 A They would like to be, but I think that in many cases we
18 see that a lot of them are not. Again, there's always
19 exceptions. You can't generalize, but it's fairly normal to
20 have individuals involved in jihadist activities who engage in
21 behaviors that are very un-Islamic. Let's put it like that.

22 Q Can you give us an example?

23 A Well, since --

24 MR. MAYNARD: Objection, Your Honor. It's beyond the
25 scope.

CR15-00707-PHX-SRB

LORENZO VIDINO

3-9-16

1 THE COURT: Overruled. You may answer.

2 THE WITNESS: First example that comes to mind
3 because we talked about the Tsarnaev brothers, they both --
4 both the younger, but particularly the younger, but also the
5 older, the elder used drugs. They dated.

6 So all behaviors, but not behaviors that somebody
7 that claims to be strictly Muslim should engage in. But I
8 think it's fairly normal. I can think of -- well, the 9/11
9 highjackers that used to go to strip clubs in Vegas. It's
10 fairly normal.

11 Q Would going to a strip club be consistent with a devout
12 Muslim practice?

13 A No. Absolutely not.

14 Q And why so?

15 A Because, obviously, the engagement with the other sexes
16 under very strict rules. So probably it's a little of the
17 opposite of what the kind of behavior that a devout Muslim
18 should engage in.

19 Q Dr. Sageman testified that perpetrators of an attack would
20 be happy and celebrate upon hearing that the other
21 perpetrators had achieved martyrdom.

22 A True.

23 Q Based upon your experience and everything that you have
24 seen and researched, are perpetrators of an attack only happy
25 and celebrate that those have died in an attack have died?

CR15-00707-PHX-SRB

LORENZO VIDINO

3-9-16

1 A Well, they obviously are happy among themselves. They
2 celebrate the fact that somebody has achieved martyrdom, as
3 you know, achieved jihada, achieved martyrdom, and achieved
4 Paradise.

5 Obviously extraordinary, that behavior might be
6 different. Those that do not die and participate in the
7 attack in one way or the other, obviously are not going to
8 make that joy and participation for the event known to the
9 outside world, obviously, because they might be afraid that
10 there will be consequences for bad behavior.

11 Q Dr. Sageman testified about his opinions on Evan Kohlmann.
12 And as it relates to ISIS, do you have an opinion about Evan
13 Kohlmann's knowledge base as it relates to the Islamic State?

14 A He has been studying the subject for a long time. I think
15 Kohlmann was working on al-Qa'ida in Iraq already, which is
16 the group that preceded ISIS, Arabian 2006/2007 when really
17 the group started.

18 Plus, he -- as I think Dr. Sageman admitted, he's
19 very knowledgeable on everything that goes on online. And
20 it's well known that ISIS is very good at using the Internet
21 and social media so that that allows Kohlmann to be quite
22 knowledgeable on ISIS propaganda and ISIS activities.

23 Q Let's talk about that for a second.

24 Based upon your research, your studies, your
25 experience, is media propaganda for the Islamic State an

CR15-00707-PHX-SRB

LORENZO VIDINO

3-9-16

1 effective recruitment tool?

2 A Absolutely.

3 Q And Dr. Sageman talked about how people would see the
4 brutal murders and the videos that they put out of slaying
5 people.

6 Based upon your experience, those particular videos
7 that the Islamic State propaganda machine releases, do they
8 have an effect in the recruitment of violent homegrown
9 extremists?

10 A Yeah. Generally speaking, yes.

11 Obviously, as I said, we have very different profiles
12 of individuals who are attracted to ISIS. Some of them would
13 be attracted to certain aspects of the propaganda; some others
14 to others.

15 But it's very clear that some individuals are
16 attracted specifically to the violent videos. They tend to be
17 very widely shared on social media.

18 You do see -- well, when we are at the Center at
19 George Washington University that I run is that we monitor
20 that scene online on social media. So we do see what they
21 talk about, what ISIS sympathizers talk about on social media.

22 And we see the enthusiasm that exists when some of
23 the most gruesome of videos come out. Those are the ones that
24 get a lot of people going; not everybody, but quite a few
25 people.

CR15-00707-PHX-SRB

LORENZO VIDINO

3-9-16

1 Q Are you familiar with the websites Hoor-al-ayn and
2 Kalamullah?

3 A Yes.

4 Q And those two websites, are those just for followers of
5 conservative Islam?

6 A I think that's an understatement. I think it's extremely
7 conservative Islam, to say the least, but I would say quite on
8 the militant side.

9 Not everybody that is on it is jihadists, but I think
10 it's sometimes a fine line. Of course, it's difficult to
11 really -- you know, it's not black and white, but I would say
12 it's more than just conservative.

13 Q Do violent homegrown extremists watch and look at material
14 on those websites?

15 A Yes. It's a link. The tradition is being shared quite
16 often.

17 MS. BROOK: May I have a moment?

18 THE COURT: Yes.

19 MS. BROOK: I don't have any other questions.

20 THE COURT: Thank you.

21 Mr. Maynard?

22 **CROSS EXAMINATION**

23 BY MR. MAYNARD:

24 Q Dr. Vidino, did Dr. Sageman get anything right?

25 A Yeah. Quite a few things.

CR15-00707-PHX-SRB

LORENZO VIDINO

3-9-16

1 Q Is Dr. Sageman a well-known scholar in the area?

2 A Sure. Absolutely.

3 Q Is he well respected?

4 A By some.

5 Q Are his works considered to be groundbreaking?

6 A Oh, absolutely. I would say particularly the 2003/2004,
7 the first book, Understanding Terrorist Network.

8 Absolutely, the whole idea of the bunch of guys was
9 absolutely groundbreaking at the time. I relied upon it
10 myself a lot.

11 Q I'm sorry?

12 A I use it myself quite a bit.

13 Q Okay. Are there times when Dr. Sageman is controversial
14 with other people?

15 A Absolutely.

16 Q Okay. You told us that you're the -- you're teaching at
17 George Washington University?

18 A No. I'm direct -- I'm teaching as an adjunct, but my main
19 job there is I run a center, a research center.

20 Q Okay. This research center that you run, this is an
21 administrative position that you have?

22 A I'm the Director. I'm the Head of Research. It's not an
23 administrative. I mean, I run the research. I direct it.

24 Q And how many employees are there that are working there?

25 A Paid employees, we have six people; and then we have

CR15-00707-PHX-SRB

LORENZO VIDINO

3-9-16

1 some -- basically a dozen research assistants, graduate and
2 undergraduate students.

3 Q Students?

4 A Yeah.

5 Q But they're not paid?

6 A No.

7 Q And you just got your Ph.D. in March of 2010?

8 A Uh-huh.

9 Q Is that correct?

10 A That's correct.

11 Q From Tufts?

12 A From Tufts.

13 Q Okay. And this research center that you're the Director
14 of, you're the one who proposed this? You're the founder?

15 A Well, I'm not the one who proposed it, but I was called to
16 do it, but it was offered it to me, so.

17 Q That only started in April of 2015?

18 A Correct.

19 Q It's a brand new center?

20 A Correct.

21 Q Okay. And prior to that, you spent approximately a year
22 in Milan as a visiting fellow?

23 A Correct.

24 Q And just so that we're clear, when you said you have a law
25 degree from the University of Milano or University of Milan, a

CR15-00707-PHX-SRB

LORENZO VIDINO

3-9-16

1 law degree in Italy, that's an undergraduate degree? One goes
2 and they get that.

3 A Yeah. Straight from high school and they get that.

4 Q Straight from high school and then you can get a law
5 degree?

6 A It's a five-year degree, but it's undergrad.

7 Q But you do have a master's degree and you do have a Ph.D.
8 from Tufts?

9 A Correct.

10 Q Is the area that you are -- would you agree that your area
11 of expertise is primarily in the area of the New Muslim
12 Brotherhood?

13 A No. I would say it's 67 percent on the jihadi network
14 and -- I mean it's difficult to really put a number, but 30,
15 40 percent on the Brotherhood; and the two things are not
16 completely -- I mean, there's a lot of overlap between the
17 two.

18 Q Sure. When it comes to al-Awlaki, now, there's no
19 question he was an Imam in San Diego for a while, correct?

20 A Correct.

21 Q He was an Imam in Falls Church, Virginia, at the time of
22 9/11?

23 A Yep.

24 Q And after 9/11 happened, like you, he was somebody that
25 people would contact to ask questions in the media?

CR15-00707-PHX-SRB

LORENZO VIDINO

3-9-16

1 A Absolutely.

2 Q He was in the New York Times?

3 A Absolutely.

4 Q He was in the -- all the national media that pretty much
5 you have mentioned you --

6 A Yeah.

7 Q Okay. Actually, PBS did a documentary called Legacy Of
8 The Prophet where al-Awlaki made an appearance in that in
9 2002?

10 A Uh-huh.

11 Q Is that correct?

12 A I believe so.

13 Q Okay. And then al-Awlaki ends up leaving the United
14 States around 2004 and goes --

15 A And he goes back and forth for a bit but, yeah, he spends
16 some time in the UK. Then comes back and realizes things are
17 --

18 Q Things are sort of strange --

19 A -- things are difficult for him, right, and he leaves the
20 country for good.

21 Q All right. So he spends a couple of years in the UK or
22 coming back and forth?

23 A Yeah, more or less.

24 Q And eventually goes to Yemen in 2007?

25 A I think 2006.

CR15-00707-PHX-SRB

LORENZO VIDINO

3-9-16

1 Q Okay. And then he is --

2 A He gets arrested.

3 Q I don't even need to ask questions.

4 A I'm sorry. Sorry. I didn't mean to interrupt you.

5 Q That's okay. He's arrested and he's jailed for a couple
6 of years, a year-and-a-half?

7 A Yeah. Yeah.

8 Q And clearly when he gets out, he is at least more publicly
9 radical --

10 A Correct.

11 Q -- than he was before?

12 A Absolutely.

13 Q And he certainly becomes a terrorist near the end of his
14 lifetime?

15 A Correct, yes.

16 Q But he is killed prior to ISIS even forming?

17 A Yeah. He had nothing to do -- it's al-Qa'ida. Nothing to
18 do with ISIS.

19 Q Okay. You were telling us a little bit about the
20 individuals who commit acts of terror and they achieve a
21 martyrdom.

22 One of the reasons, in part, is because they'll get
23 those 72 black-eyed virgins; is that correct?

24 A Obviously, everybody has got different motivations, but if
25 you look at what individuals who would carry out attacks and

CR15-00707-PHX-SRB

LORENZO VIDINO

3-9-16

1 die talk about, yes, they often mention the 72 virgins and the
2 green birds of Paradise, all the gifts and blessings that will
3 come once you achieve martyrdom, yes.

4 Q And so these individuals that have committed sins under
5 the Islamic faith, if they commit a martyrdom, they then --
6 those sins are forgiven because they go to heaven and they get
7 the green birds, they got the black-eyed virgins, correct?

8 A Correct. Correct.

9 Q So if you are a sinner, this is a good thing for you,
10 right?

11 A That's how some of them believe it to be, yes.

12 Q Just briefly on the issue of Azzam, wasn't the United
13 States on the side of Azzam when he was alive? Azzam.

14 A I think that's a slight simplification. I would say that
15 the United States was supporting the Afghans against the
16 Soviets, that's for sure, so they were on the same side.

17 I think there was -- you know, I've never seen any
18 evidence. I don't think anybody has ever really shown
19 evidence of direct support of Azzam, bin Laden, and the Arab
20 Mujahideen by the United States.

21 The United States used proxies to support everybody
22 that fought the Soviets. In most cases that proxy was the
23 Pakistani government and Pakistani intelligence agencies. So
24 they are on the same side, but I don't -- I'm not aware of any
25 evidence of direct support.

CR15-00707-PHX-SRB

LORENZO VIDINO

3-9-16

1 Q There was a book of several years ago written on The
2 Falling Towers?

3 A The Looming Tower.

4 Q The Looming Towers?

5 A Yeah. Lawrence White.

6 Q Won a Pulitzer Prize?

7 A Right.

8 Q History of al-Qa'ida and Osama bin Laden?

9 A Best book on the subject.

10 Q Best book.

11 And it does indicate that the United States actually
12 supported the side that Osama bin Laden was on at that time?

13 A It supported the side. I'm not sure it was direct
14 support, as I said. I mean, to some degree you can argue --

15 Q Well, The Looming Tower seemed to -- whoever the author
16 was of the Looming Tower --

17 A Lawrence White.

18 Q Right. Seemed to imply that in a --

19 A No. I don't think it was -- I'm quoted in the book. I
20 know the book very well. I helped in the research.

21 No, I don't think that's what he said. He said, of
22 course, we're on the same side. There was some indirect
23 flirtation, you can argue. I think that's the extent that he
24 would argue there was -- to some degree you can argue like the
25 U.S. has some groups in Syria now that are fighting Assad and

CR15-00707-PHX-SRB

LORENZO VIDINO

3-9-16

1 are Islamists, like Sabbatai Muslims, so -- and it doesn't
2 mean that just because they're both against Assad that they
3 are fighting together.

4 Q The United States was going to at that particular time
5 would support pretty much anybody --

6 A Yeah.

7 Q -- who was going against the Soviet Union.

8 A Absolutely.

9 Q Okay. You didn't mean to imply that CAIR, the Counsel on
10 American Islamic Relations, is a terrorist organization, did
11 you?

12 A No. No. No. I stated a fact that in 2007 it was
13 mentioned as an unindicted co-conspirator in the largest
14 terrorism financing case in U.S. history which is the Holy
15 Land Foundation case in Dallas, Texas. That's all.

16 Q But there's no findings against CAIR?

17 A Because it was unindicted.

18 Q Right.

19 A Everything else in the --

20 Q Yeah.

21 A Absolutely.

22 Q I mean you're a lawyer. You know that if there had been
23 strong evidence, they would have been indicted.

24 A Absolutely.

25 Q Okay. So you didn't mean to imply that there was

CR15-00707-PHX-SRB

LORENZO VIDINO

3-9-16

1 something wrong?

2 A No. But at the same time, I think it says something about
3 the organization.

4 Q Okay. In fact, CAIR is sometimes analogized to the ACLU?

5 A By some, I guess.

6 Q By some?

7 A Depends by who.

8 Q Did you read Peter Bergen's book on the United States of
9 Jihad?

10 A It just came out. I started reading it. It literally
11 came out a few weeks ago.

12 Q Did you notice that Dr. Sageman was mentioned numerous
13 times in there?

14 A Yeah. I did notice that.

15 Q Actually, it even had his picture in there.

16 A Yeah.

17 Q I didn't see you mentioned in there.

18 A No. I don't think I am, yeah.

19 Q Evan Kohlmann is not mentioned in there either, is he?

20 You don't know?

21 A I didn't look for his name to be honest.

22 Q Are you and Evan Kohlmann very close?

23 A We're friends, yeah, absolutely.

24 Q Been friends a long time?

25 A Yes.

CR15-00707-PHX-SRB

LORENZO VIDINO

3-9-16

1 Q And, in fact, you're familiar with the book that he wrote?

2 A Oh, yeah.

3 Q Okay. Is it -- did you assist him in any of the research
4 he did in that book?

5 A Yes. I provided him some documents.

6 Q Is that why he put you in the Acknowledgments of his book
7 back in 2004?

8 A Exactly. Exactly.

9 MR. MAYNARD: I don't have any further questions.

10 THE COURT: Any questions on redirect, Ms. Brook?

11 MS. BROOK: Just very briefly.

12 **REDIRECT EXAMINATION**

13 Q Defense counsel asked you if you're friends with Evan
14 Kohlmann. Are you also friends with Dr. Sageman?

15 A Yes. I would say so.

16 MS. BROOK: I don't have any other questions.

17 THE COURT: May Dr. Vidino be excused as a witness?

18 MS. BROOK: Yes.

19 THE COURT: Any objection?

20 MR. MAYNARD: Yes -- no.

21 THE COURT: Thank you very much, Dr. Vidino.

22 You may step down and you are excused as a witness.

23 (End of excerpt of proceedings.)

24 * * *

25

CR15-00707-PHX-SRB

LORENZO VIDINO

3-9-16

C E R T I F I C A T E

I, ELIZABETH A. LEMKE, do hereby certify that I am duly appointed and qualified to act as Official Court Reporter for the United States District Court for the District of Arizona.

I FURTHER CERTIFY that the foregoing pages constitute a full, true, and accurate transcript of all of that portion of the proceedings contained herein, had in the above-entitled cause on the date specified therein, and that said transcript was prepared under my direction and control.

DATED at Phoenix, Arizona, this 27th day of June, 2016.

s/Elizabeth A. Lemke
ELIZABETH A. LEMKE, RDR, CRR, CPE